Identifying the Impact of U.S. State Work Relief Programs on Height using a Polygenic Score

David H. Rehkopf, Sepideh Modrek, Benjamin Domingue, Amal Harrati, Mark Cullen

Study Question

Does incorporating a polygenic score for height allow more sensitive detection of environmental impacts on height?

Project Overview

The impact of major macroeconomic policy on human health and development is still unclear, and the role that policies play in impacting key health indicators such as height are not well understood. An approach for considering this potential is by examining how the generosity of large public policies varied, policies that have an impact on other more proximal determinants of height that include multiple pathways of impact. One such exposure is unemployment, an attribute that on the aggregate is under substantial influence by various macroeconomic policy levers. The largest temporary policy for increasing employment in the last 100 years was the New Deal associated work relief programs that were implemented beginning in 1932 with the election of Franklin Roosevelt. The total spending of the Works Progress Administration between 1935 and 1943 was \$13.4 Billion, which provided employment for eight and a half million individuals, at the time the population of the U.S. was 132 million.

The material impact of this program was stunning, with the work resulting in 650,000 miles of new or improved roads, 124,000 new or improved bridges, 39,000 schools built, improved or repaired, 24,000 miles of sewer lines installed and 4,000 new or improved utility plants.

The map to the right shows the location of New Deal Programs. Further details are available at livingnewdeal.org



Data and Exposures

We used data from the Health and Retirement Study from 1992 to 2012. The baseline survey in 1992 was of U.S. residents born 1931 to 1941 and their spouses, with new samples added in 1998, 2004 and 2010. Height was measured among participants. We used a genome wide polygenic score for height as constructed by the Health and Retirement Study. Respondents answered a question on what state they were born in. For exposure we consider three categories of state employment generated by the Work Progress Administration (WPA), 2-4%, 4-6% and greater than 6%. We perform a falsification test with individuals born in the birth cohort 1925 to 1940 as the "treated group", and those born before and after as "untreated".

Descriptive Results

Using 1940 full count public census data we characterized the proportion of working age individuals who received employment through the WPA program by state. This varies between 2% and 9%.

Prior to analyses we analyzed the potential for rGE between state WPA employment and polygenic risk score and found no evidence for this.





Model 1 shows PGS for height, model 2 WPA employment categories, and model 3 the G x E. The first row shows that in model 1 a one standard deviation difference in the PGS is associated with 2.1 centimeters in height. Model 2 shows that WPA employment category 2 (4-6%) and WPA employment category 3 (>6%) as compared to the omitted WPA employment category 1 (2-4%) are not associated with differences in height. In model 3, the interaction between the polygenic risk score and WPA employment category 3 is associated with 2.2 cm greater height (95%) CI 0.611 to 3.955).

	WPA	and Height				
	PGS	WPA	GxE			
	(1)	(2)	(3)			
htStdPGS	2.151***		2.120***			
	(1.729, 2.574)		(1.479, 2.761)			
wpacat2		0.330	0.467			
		(-0.203, 0.863)	(-0.196, 1.130)			
wpacat3		0.296	-1.096*			
		(-0.515, 1.108)	(-2.368, 0.175)			
single	-6.008	-6.963	-6.786			
	(-15.910, 3.895)	(-17.395, 3.469)	(-17.121, 3.549)			
stateWhite	0.541	0.711	1.048			
	(-2.716, 3.798)	(-2.683, 4.104)	(-2.305, 4.401)			
medianIncome	0.0002	0.0002	0.0003*			
	(-0.0001, 0.0004)	(-0.0001, 0.0005)	(-0.00002, 0.001)			
unemployment	4.646	1.341	1.371			
	(-5.696, 14.987)	(-11.135, 13.817)	(-10.939, 13.682)			
highschool	3.474	4.430	3.131			
	(-2.407, 9.355)	(-1.587, 10.447)	(-2.817, 9.080)			
own	-4.319**	-4.549**	-4.740***			
	(-7.626, -1.013)	(-8.105, -0.994)	(-8.268, -1.213)			
urban	-2.885*	-3 170*	-3 498**			
	(-5.860, 0.090)	(-6.359, 0.019)	(-6.663, -0.332)			
oini	-3 671	-3.813	-2.746			
g	(-11.289, 3.947)	(-11.733, 4.108)	(-10.564, 5.073)			
region1	0.098	-0.110	0.101			
8	(-0.873, 1.068)	(-1.101, 0.881)	(-0.879, 1.081)			
region2	0.104	0.069	0.020			
- 8	(-1.009, 1.216)	(-1.062, 1.200)	(-1.097, 1.136)			
region3	0.374	0.307	0.253			
8	(-0.504, 1.251)	(-0.592, 1.206)	(-0.634, 1.141)			
PC1w	-133 579*	48.106	-126 155*			
	(-271.265, 4.106)	(-86.577, 182.789)	(-263.953, 11.644)			
PC2w	-2.259	172,100	23.930			
	(-1,027.317, 1,022.798) (-865.748, 1,209.948)	(-1,001.052, 1,048.911			
PC3w	-74.135	95.521	-31.663			
	(-968.698, 820.429)	(-810.056, 1,001.098)	(-925.998, 862.672)			
htStdPGS:wpacat2			-0.222			
			(-1.022, 0.578)			
htStdPGS:wpacat3			2 283***			
niotar optimpaeado			(0.611, 3.955)			
Constant	(7,554***	(0.104***	(0.011, 0.955)			
Constant	67.334	69.184 (64.049, 74.319)	67.401 (62.317,72.485)			
λ7	2.965	(04.047, 74.317)	(02.317, 72.403)			
IV	3,863 11 221 260	3,863 11 260 040	3,863 11 215 800			
Akaike Inf Crit	-11,221.200	-11,209.940	22 471 600			
Notes:	22,171.520	***~~ ·~				
woies:		Significai	nt at the 1 percent leve			
		Significar	nt at the 5 percent leve			
		[*] Significant	t at the 10 percent leve			

1. We examined placebo cohorts pre and post that would not be expected to benefit from the policy - **PASS**

2. We used random forest to pick the top 25 covariates that predict state level WPA spending as control variables from among over 400 census variables from 1900 to 1940 (see right). We then refit our models controlling for the top 8 that captured the most variance – **PASS**

3. We included interaction terms between control variables and WPA exposure as well as height PGS - FAIL

environmental and genetic exposures.

New data and theory driven approaches to choosing comprehensive controls for confounding in gene x environment studies may have substantial benefits for power and validity of findings in future work.

L Examine other environmental exposures for interactions with height PGS for the outcome of attained height.

2. Apply data driven methods for covariate adjustment, including multiple interactions between variables, for statistical control in gene X environment studies.

3. Repeat analyses with individually linked census data. HRS and PSID linkages are being done by Robert Warren (U. Minnesota). We are linking 1940 Census data to the Women's Health Initiative data.

References and Acknowledgments

Fishback PV, Haines MR, Kantor SE, Births, deaths, and New Deal relief during the Great Depression. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research, 2005. Fishback PV, Horrace WC, Kantor S. Did New Deal Grant Programs Stimulate Local Economies? A Study of Federal Grants and Retail Sales During the Great Depression. The Journal of Economic History, 65:36-71, 2005. Keller M. Gene x environment studies have not properly controlled for potential confounders: the problem and the (simple) solution. Biological Psychiatry, 75:18-24, 2014. DR acknowledges funding from K01 AG047280. Special thanks to participants and staff of the Health and Retirement Study in particular Erin Ware, Lauren Schmitz and Jessica Faul for creating the polygenic scores.

Robustness Checks



Conclusion

While initial analyses showed that including a polygenic score for height allowed the identification of effects of the WPA program on attained height, this effect was eliminated after controlling for interactions between control variables and the

Next Steps

me Machington	Markinghor Laceported place Section Construction of the United States and the United Sta												0 ,194		
LOCATION ROUSEBOLD DA		BELATION	PERSONAL DESCRIPTION	EDUCATION	PLACE OF BIRTH	St. RESIDENCE.	APRIL 1, 1888	alania, Inc.	in Page	PERSONS 1-	TRAPS OLD AND OVER	-ENPLOYMENT STATE	- Taiking	-	- Enu
Inc. P. Book, stream, soli, ch. Book, stream, Soli, ch. Roman, and Solidari, in white of Roman and Solidaria and Solidaria Annual Format, a stream of Network Sound, Sound, a stream	These of each percent where sound place to an advance on A place 1, 1940, we in the based of the sound of the sound of the sound of the sound of the sound of the sound of sound of the sou		Maint Bar Man (K. Franks (F. Onle a ma Age at ha barbar Reference (K. K. Maint	Warmer (PK), Browner (D) Alteriol (Sect.) (Sect.) (And Ku- Alteriol (Sect.) (Sect.) (And Ku- Righent grade of editor compared (COBR (Javen bank)		If they exact the train of the second				「「「「「「「」」」	OCCUPACIO Para a porten a di surati di Dali II. M. 100 di surati di surativa di surati di surativa di surati di surativa di surati di surativa di surati di di surativa di surati di di surativa di surati di di surativa di surati di di surativa di surati di surativa di surati di surativa di surativa surativa di surativa surativa di surativa surativa di surativa	A DESCRIPTION AND CLAIM OF and an application association application the second second second provided the second second second provided the second second second second application and secon		Particular for the state of a line Spectrum for the state of a line Amount of states and the states of 1920	and and and any state
1 3 3 4 5	1 1	8 A	9 10 11 18	13 14 3	11 C	10 17 10	19 10 D	11 11 10	24 25 R	36 97	14	80	30 T	21	- 83
1 Contid	Hampton Vaulana	aughter	FWIZS	266	Montana	tost leck the Con	Martin 20 31			-	A	. 0: 0			-
2 [her] 247 A int	Curam Robert C.	Thed	A 47 47	A 4420	a la	fame place	NO7 2 0111	16	/	84	The harge	and children to	4 156 412	52 102	5 A.
1 1 1		Heat	M # 36 %		anna 1	Mr. anna Heage	Bolington to 1014	15	//	40 × 0	and granter	Lagary and	Teress OV 1	7 100	12 Te
3 248 R 10	Jorne, Horry	12	E w 31 m	81818	m. 0 32	1 1 A 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1					1 1000 1	COT 1111-14	PROFESSION 1	41 5	au
1 Could 2 (117) 247 A 14	Cerson Robert 4	Head .	N W 47 Q M W 34 A	2 8 8	Repeter 1	Par floor March Marcan Marchan Stragio	Munitar 20 18 21 Roxaxo	40 44	/	64 40	This know	Ditching C.	2-156 419 1 2-958 08 1	52 100	